

Application No: 12/3784M

Location: MACCLESFIELD DISTRICT HOSPITAL, VICTORIA ROAD,
MACCLESFIELD, SK10 3BL

Proposal: Change of use of the Ingersley and Henbury buildings to form 36 apartments. Works to curtilage buildings within the overall grounds of the Grade II Listed Clocktower building, including alterations associated with the residential conversion of the Ingersley and Henbury buildings, together with the demolition of the Education and Training building and the Pavillion building (Listed Building Consent)

Applicant: KEYWORKER HOMES & EAST CHESHIRE N H S

Expiry Date: 11-Jan-2013

Date Report Prepared: 15 March 2013

REASON FOR REPORT

This application has been brought to Committee as the parallel application for full planning (12/3779m) is an application for major development and under the Council's terms of delegation is required to be determined by Committee.

SUMMARY RECOMMENDATION	Approve subject to conditions
-------------------------------	--------------------------------------

MAIN ISSUES

- The impact of the proposal on the architectural and historic integrity of the listed buildings (Ingersley and Henbury)
- Whether the demolition of the education and training building and the pavilion building is acceptable

DESCRIPTION OF SITE AND CONTEXT

The application site comprises the Ingersley, Henbury, education and training and pavilion buildings together with surrounding land and access. The site is located towards the southern end of the Macclesfield Hospital site. All of the buildings are curtilage Grade II Listed buildings and are currently used by the hospital, primarily as offices. The Ingersley building is a two storey, rectangular shaped building constructed primarily from stone. The Henbury building is a two and a half storey building, also constructed from stone. The education and training

building is a two storey building constructed from a mixture of natural and re-constituted stone and the pavilion building is a brick built single storey building. Vehicular access to the buildings is currently via the main hospital entrance, with a one way system operating around the Ingersley building. The Grade II Listed Clock tower building which has recently been converted to residential accommodation is located to the north of the site, with the recently constructed care home and new build residential flats located to the east and the Regency Hospital located to the south.

DETAILS OF PROPOSAL

Listed building consent is sought for internal and external alterations to the Ingersley and Henbury buildings in association with their residential conversion and for the demolition of the education and training building and the pavilion buildings.

An application for full planning permission for the proposed development is also being considered by the Council (12/3779M), a report on which is on this agenda. Additionally the Council is considering an outline application for a three storey office building and 34 new build dwellings (12/3786M). A report on this application is also on this agenda.

RELEVANT HISTORY

The Macclesfield Hospital site has an extensive history, the most relevant applications to this proposal are outlined below:

09/1300M - PROPOSED ERECTION OF :- A 3 STOREY 75 ONE BED CARE HOME; A 3 STOREY BUILDING INCORPORATING A TOTAL OF 542 SQ M OF RETAIL IN 3 GROUND FLOOR UNITS WITH 16 APARTMENTS (8 ONE BED & 8 TWO BED) ON THE UPPER 2 FLOORS; A 3 STOREY OFFICE BUILDING OF 3,599 SQ M (TO BE DIVIDED UP INTO 2 400 SQ M OF B1 ON THE FIRST AND SECOND FLOORS AND 1 199 SQ M OF D1 USE ON THE GROUND FLOOR); 15NO. 2.5 STOREY TOWNHOUSES IN 7 BLOCKS; ASSOCIATED CAR PARKING AREAS, ACCESS ROADS & OPEN SPACE; ADDITIONAL HOSPITAL RELATED CAR PARKING AT PROPOSED FIRST FLOOR DECK. (OUTLINE APPLICATION). Approved 18.12.09

09/1296M - CHANGE OF USE AND ALTERATIONS TO GRADE II LISTED CLOCKTOWER BUILDING TO PROVIDE 36 AFFORDABLE FOR RENT APARTMENTS, 161 SQ M COFFEE SHOP, 183 SQ M GYM AND ANCILLARY ACCOMMODATION; ASSOCIATED CAR PARKING AND EXTERNAL SITE WORKS; DEMOLITION OF 2 CURTILAGE BUILDINGS (BUILDINGS 2 AND 9) TO ENABLE THE ASSOCIATED MIXED USE DEVELOPMENT WITHIN THE OVERALL APPLICATION SITE AND WHICH IS THE SUBJECT OF A SEPARATE OUTLINE PLANNING APPLICATION. (FULL PLANNING). Approved 18.12.09

09/1295M - CHANGE OF USE AND ALTERATIONS TO GRADE II LISTED CLOCKTOWER BUILDING TO PROVIDE 36 AFFORDABLE FOR RENT APARTMENTS, 161 SQ M COFFEE SHOP, 183 SQ M GYM AND ANCILLARY ACCOMMODATION; ASSOCIATED CAR PARKING AND EXTERNAL SITE WORKS; DEMOLITION OF 2 CURTILAGE BUILDINGS (BUILDINGS 2 AND 9) TO ENABLE THE ASSOCIATED MIXED USE DEVELOPMENT WITHIN THE OVERALL APPLICATION SITE AND WHICH IS THE SUBJECT OF A

SEPERATE OUTLINE PLANNING APPLICATION. (LISTED BUILDING CONSENT).
Approved 18.12.09

07/3054P – New entrance to rear of Ingersley building. Approved 25.02.08.

POLICIES

Regional Spatial Strategy

DP7 Promote Environmental Quality

EM1 Integration and Protection of the Region's Environmental Assets

Local Plan Policy

BE2 Historic Fabric

BE15 Buildings of Architectural and Historic Importance

BE17 Demolition of Listed Buildings

BE18 Listed Building Consent

Other Material Considerations

National Planning Policy Framework

CONSULTATIONS (External to Planning)

English Heritage: application should be determined in accordance with national and local policy guidance and on the basis of the Council's expert conservation advice.

National Amenity Societies: no comments received.

VIEWS OF THE PARISH / TOWN COUNCIL

Not applicable.

OTHER REPRESENTATIONS

Macclesfield Civic Society – the applications represent a major proposal within the hospital site which merits careful study. However, the Society welcome a mixed use proposal involving conversion of Listed Buildings to affordable social housing and the provision of new small private housing to accommodate local needs. The office use appears acceptable as part of the mixed development. Clearly much will depend upon the evaluation of the transport assessment and site specific impacts on trees and the residential amenities of existing and proposed occupiers. In principle the scheme is welcomed.

APPLICANT'S SUPPORTING INFORMATION

The following documents have been submitted in support of the application:

- Planning Statement
- Design & Access Statement

- Heritage Appraisal

Copies of these documents are available to view on the application file.

The Heritage Statement concludes that careful consideration of the comparative values of the buildings reveals that only the Ingersley and Henbury blocks possess the joint potential of further enhancing the setting of the listed building and the practical capability for re-use. The education block and pavilion, although of respective historical and aesthetic interest, are of lower significance, with the former in fact exerting a negative impact upon the aesthetic values of the site on account of past schemes of unsympathetic extension.

The emergent design for Hope Park phase II has targeted the sympathetic renovation and conversion of the Ingersley and Henbury blocks as part of the wider scheme for site redevelopment

OFFICER APPRAISAL

Principle of Development

The principle of altering listed buildings is acceptable provided that the architectural and historic integrity of the listed buildings is maintained.

The principle of demolishing listed buildings is in most cases not acceptable. Section 12 of the NPPF advises that as heritage assets are irreplaceable, any harm or loss should require clear and convincing justification.

Alteration to the Ingersley and Henbury Buildings

Ingersley Building

Relatively minor external alterations are proposed to the Ingersley building to facilitate the change of use to apartments. Probably the most significant change involves the removal of a number of unsympathetic additions including a single storey extension to the rear and a two storey lift shaft to the front. Additionally an existing escape staircase is to be removed and a number of new/altered window and door openings are proposed.

Internally the layout is to be significantly altered, although it is unlikely that much of the original layout remains given the historical use of the building.

Henbury Building

Very minor alterations are proposed to the Henbury building and only involve one of the side elevations. An existing external staircase and steps are to be removed and three door openings are being changed to windows.

Internally some changes are proposed to the layout, though much of the proposed layout mirrors the existing.

It is considered that the changes proposed, subject to the imposition of appropriate conditions regarding finishes and materials, would respect the architectural and historic integrity of the buildings. With regard to both buildings, it is considered that the proposed removal of unsympathetic additions will improve the overall appearance of the buildings.

The Council's Conservation Officer has been consulted on the application and raises no objections to the proposed changes to the Ingersley and Henbury buildings.

Proposed Demolitions

Education and training block

According to the submitted Heritage Statement, the Education and training block was built as a fever (isolation) hospital in 1853-46 and was part of the workhouse. In the c20th the building was subject to major extension which almost doubled the overall footprint. The original building was rectangular in plan with front and rear projections, two storeys in height and orientated along the north south axis. A major extension exists to the southern end - this conceals much of the original exterior fabric – and there are other smaller additions elsewhere. The original building is of coursed rubble beneath tiled gabled roofs, much in keeping with Ingersley and the main hospital block. By contrast the extensions adopt a range of different, unsympathetic materials.

Due to a number of unsympathetic alterations and extensions, it is considered that the heritage value of the education and training block is limited. No objections are therefore raised to its demolition as it is considered that its demolition and replacement with a more appropriate building would serve to enhance the setting of the remaining listed buildings.

Pavilion building

According to the submitted Heritage Statement this range, comprising three small individual blocks connected by covered arcades, is located south of Ingersley and is orientated along the east west axis. The plan is symmetrical with the central block bearing a date stone of 1894. Unlike the other buildings, it is constructed of brick with hipped roofs to the blocks and gabled roofs to the arcades, all tiled. Its style is clearly different from that adopted by all of the workhouse buildings, and its original function is unclear. The building resembles structures more commonly associated with parks and gardens. Old mapping shows that it was built on a neighbouring plot of land which seems not to have been part of the workhouse site. A path ran from Ingersley to the pavilion, thus suggesting some connected purpose, but the first map showing the plot as part of the (now) hospital dates from 1968. It is therefore unclear as to whether the pavilion is a curtilage building in accordance with the 1990 Planning (etc.) Act.

Whilst the pavilion building is considered to be of interest, it does not appear to have a historic connection to other listed buildings on site and indeed it is questionable as to whether it is in fact curtilage listed. Whilst its loss is unfortunate, given the above, it is considered that its heritage significance is limited and provided that there could be some mitigation attributed to its loss in the form of using the same roof tile pattern on the new build houses as currently exists on this building and across the rest of the site this would help to mitigate for the loss of this building.

No objections have been raised by the Council's Conservation Officer to the demolition of these buildings.

CONCLUSIONS AND REASON(S) FOR THE DECISION

The proposed internal and external alterations to the Ingersley and Henbury buildings are considered to be acceptable as they would respect the architectural and historic integrity of the buildings. Similarly the demolition of the education and training building and the pavilion building is acceptable as in the case of the education and training building, it is considered that the heritage value of this building is limited and it is questionable as to whether the pavilion building is in fact curtilage listed. In any event, it does not appear to have any historical connection to the other listed buildings on site.

Application for Listed Building Consent

RECOMMENDATION: Approve subject to following conditions

1. A07LB - Standard Time Limit
2. A01AP - Development in accord with approved plans
3. A05EX - Details of materials to be submitted
4. A09EX - Rainwater goods
5. A20EX - Submission of details of windows
6. A22EX - Roofing material

(c) Crown copyright and database rights 2013. Ordnance Survey
100049045, 100049046.

